_____

Beyond Narratives: Exploring East-West Dichotomy in In an Antique Land

_____

Sayed Raj Askari[1]
Assistant Professor at Integral University, Lucknow
Fatima Durrani[2]
MA student at Jamia Millia Islamia

_____

Abstract: The study of the narratives and categories in which the East and the West are divided becomes an important field of study for scholars. It has been imposed through different mediums and studies, using interpellation and coercion. The paper explores the nuances and narratives of colonial discourse in the novel In an Antique Land by Amitav Ghosh. The research paper portrays the elements of colonial narratives to showcase the West as superior. This highlights the points from the novel that could be exemplars of the Colonial Hegemony. The novel explores the narratives of the West, and the paper examines three key aspects of the text: first, Ghosh's reconstruction of the interconnected precolonial histories of Egypt and India, which disrupts the colonial portrayal of the East as stagnant; second, his critique of modernity, which reveals its role in reinforcing the binary through Western ideals of progress; and third, his own positioning as a narrator navigating the liminal space between Eastern heritage and Western academic training.

For decades, the narrative of East versus West has shaped global perceptions, creating a dichotomy where the West is seen as the cradle of progress and rationality while the East is relegated to a realm of mysticism, stagnation, and timelessness. But is this binary a reflection of truth or a construct born out of colonial dominance? Such questions are not just matters of historical curiosity but are central to understanding how the legacies of colonialism continue to shape cultural and academic discourses today. The East-West binary, a framework deeply Rooted in colonial discourse, has shaped global perceptions for centuries, influencing everything from historical narratives to cultural identities. This dichotomy gained prominence during the colonial era, where the West positioned itself as the epitome of progress, rationality, and modernity, while the East was cast as stagnant, mystical, and in need of "civilizing." These ideas were reinforced by colonial historiography and anthropological studies, which often presented the East through a lens of exoticism and otherness. Today, as postcolonial theorists challenge these constructed narratives, texts like Amitav Ghosh's In An Antique Land offer a counterpoint.

International Journal Of English and Studies(IJOES)

By reconstructing medieval histories of interconnected trade and cultural exchange, Ghosh dismantles the rigid East-West divide, inviting readers to reconsider the fluid and interconnected nature of history, a perspective increasingly relevant in a globalized world seeking to move beyond colonial legacies. In this paper, Amitav Ghosh's In An Antique Land provides a compelling deconstruction of the East-West binary, exposing its colonial origins and challenging its validity in understanding cultural and historical interactions. The paper defends this position by examining three key aspects of the text: first, Ghosh's reconstruction of the interconnected precolonial histories of Egypt and India, which disrupts the colonial portrayal of the East as stagnant; second, his critique of modernity, which reveals its role in reinforcing the binary through Western ideals of progress; and third, his own positioning as a narrator navigating the liminal space between Eastern heritage and Western academic training. To support the arguments, the paper portrays insights from theorists such as Homi K. Bhabha, Edward Said, Hayden White, and others, demonstrating how Ghosh's narrative reshapes our understanding of the East-West dynamic.

In An Antique Land, Amitav Ghosh dismantles the simplistic binary of the East as Traditional and the West as modern by presenting a nuanced narrative of interwoven histories and overlapping cultures. This is particularly evident in his exploration of the medieval trade networks connecting the Jewish diaspora of the Middle East to the Indian Ocean world. By uncovering these vibrant precolonial interactions, Ghosh challenges the Eurocentric notion that the East required "civilization" through colonization. Ghosh's narrative juxtaposes the dynamic and cosmopolitan precolonial trade routes with the homogenizing impact of colonial intervention. Through the story of the Jewish merchant Ben Yiju and his engagement in the Indian Ocean trade, Ghosh illustrates how the East was not a stagnant, traditional world but a thriving, interconnected, and highly sophisticated society.

These trade networks, governed by shared values and mutual dependencies, fostered a pluralistic cultural and economic exchange that transcended simplistic binaries of East versus West. Drawing from Edward Said's concept of Orientalism, Ghosh's work directly critiques the colonial narrative that framed the East as a static, backward "Other" in need of Western modernity. Said argues that Orientalism is a discourse that serves to justify imperial domination by constructing the East as a foil to the rational, progressive West. The novel is rooted in the letters of medieval Jewish traders, dating from the 10th to the 12th century, long before the colonizers arrived in the East, encompassing regions like Egypt and India.

Amitav Ghosh's novel highlights the rich and intricate East-to-East connections of this period, focusing on the relationships between Ben Yiju, a Jewish merchant; Khalaf ibn Ishaq, his Muslim friend; and Bomma, an Indian slave. Referred to as "slave of MS H6" in the historical documents. Ghosh's excavation of historical connections exposes the fallacy of this construct. Amitav Ghosh exemplifies Hayden White's idea that history is not a neutral recounting of facts but a narrative construction shaped by the historian's choices. He makes us look at Egypt and India not from a white historian's lens but rather our own lens. Ghosh's reconstruction of medieval history avoids the grand, linear narratives of Western modernity that portray the East as stagnant and in need of "civilizing."

International Journal Of English and Studies(IJOES)

_____

Instead, he offers a fragmented but interconnected narrative that reveals the East as a space of tolerance, cultural exchange, and economic sophistication, centuries before colonial intervention.

This narrative construction disrupts the colonial historiography that has long shaped perceptions of the East as inherently regressive. The East, as Ghosh reveals, was already a hub of globalized exchange, marked by advanced systems of commerce, governance, and cultural exchange. The Indian Ocean trade network exemplifies how the East functioned as a vibrant and progressive society before colonial intervention. The economic and cultural ties between regions such as India, East Africa, and the Middle East were facilitated by sophisticated maritime technologies, shared legal codes, and multilingualism. The Jewish diaspora's integration into this system highlights the inclusivity and adaptability of these societies, undermining the colonial narrative of a stagnant East. Ghosh's depiction of this world not only challenges the notion of a "traditional" East but also critiques the colonial project's self-serving narrative of "civilizing" a society that was already complex and cosmopolitan. By reconstructing these stories, Ghosh asserts the historical agency of the East, reclaiming it from the erasures imposed by colonial discourse.

Furthermore, another significant aspect to explore in the novel is the critique of modernity, which challenges the East-West binary by deconstructing the simplistic and often reductive divide between "Eastern" and "Western" societies. This binary, which has roots in colonial discourse, positions the West as the seat of progress, rationality, and modernity while relegating the East to a space of tradition, mysticism, and backwardness. Colonial powers, particularly European nations, defined "modernity" through their own ideals of progress, industrialization, scientific rationalism, and individualism. This constructed notion of modernity positioned the West as the pinnacle of civilization, while the East was often portrayed as outdated and in need of Western intervention to "civilize" and "modernize" its people.

Frantz Fanon, in particular, explores the psychological effects of colonialism in works like Black Skin and White Masks, where he describes the trauma of colonized subjects who come to see themselves through the lens of the colonizer's standards. This internalization of colonial values leads to the rejection of native cultures and knowledge systems in favor of the "civilizing" ideals of the colonizer, which are viewed as modern, rational, and progressive. This is highly evident in Chapter 11 of Nashawy, where the narrator decides to visit Imam Ibrahim, Yasir's father, who possesses great knowledge of herbal medicines. The narrator is eager to learn about folk remedies and herbal medicine from Imam Ibrahim. However, the Imam reacts with surprise and concern at the mention of this topic. He wants to know who told the narrator about his knowledge of remedies, almost as if he feels accused of something wrong. The narrator explains that many people in the village know about his expertise, but the Imam dismisses the idea, saying he is trying to forget about herbs and traditional remedies. Instead, he proudly talks about his new focus: modern medical supplies, such as vials and a hypodermic syringe. He explains that there is a high demand for injections in the village for various health issues. Imam Ibrahim's transformation can be seen as an embodiment of the larger effects of colonialism and modernization. His embrace of Western medical practices marks a shift from indigenous knowledge systems, highlighting the way colonialism influenced not only political structures but also cultural practices. His rejection of herbalism—once a revered tradition in his

International Journal Of English and Studies(IJOES)

_____

community—suggests the devaluation of local, indigenous knowledge in favor of a foreign, "modern" system. This mirrors how, under colonialism, traditional ways of life were often discredited while Western methods were imposed as a standard of efficiency and progress.

The pride he takes in his modern medical equipment—vials and syringes—signals his Acceptance of the Western idea of medical superiority. His transformation reflects the broader postcolonial process in which indigenous practices, languages, and ways of life are deemed inferior and are replaced by those of the colonizer. This mirrors the concept of cultural imperialism, where Western culture becomes the standard for global progress, and traditional or indigenous cultures are marginalized. Homi K. Bhabha's "idea of hybridity" also offers an interesting lens through which to view Imam Ibrahim's journey. Bhabha argues that colonial encounters lead to the creation of new, hybrid identities that do not wholly belong to the colonizer or the colonized. While Imam Ibrahim adopts Western medical practices, his use of these practices is not purely Western—it is a blend of his own indigenous knowledge and the new medical technologies he has embraced. This hybridity challenges the binary división between the "modern" West and the "traditional" East, illustrating how postcolonial societies often navigate a complex space between tradition and modernity, blending elements from both worlds in ways that cannot be neatly categorized. This is further explored in the final part of the novel, "Going Back," which reflects on the broader socio-cultural changes in Egypt (Thapa 4). The depiction of Egypt in this section highlights a country that has undergone significant modernization driven by global economic and technological shifts. The contrast between the humble mud walls of Abu-Ali's house and the luxurious three-story buildings that now dominate the landscape serves as a metaphor for Egypt's rapid development. Technological advances like refrigerators, televisions, and food processors symbolize the spread of Western consumerism and technology, which were once associated with colonial powers, and their "civilizing" missions have now become symbols of this newfound prosperity. Furthermore, this is evident in Nabeel's tragedy in the epilogue. Ghosh, in the epilogue, writes, "There was nothing to be seen except crowds: Nabeel had vanished into the anonymity of History" (Ghosh 199).

After colonization, many countries like Egypt were left economically dependent on the global capitalist system, and migration became a means for individuals to seek opportunities that their own countries could not provide. This movement is a result of colonial economic structures that continue to shape global labor flows today, often creating a sense of displacement and alienation for those who leave their homes in search of better opportunities. Nabeel's sacrifice, which is leaving his home, represents the personal costs that come with migration driven by economic necessity, which postcolonial thinkers argue is a direct result of historical exploitation and uneven development. Nabeel's family, now surrounded by modern comforts, still feels the absence of his presence, revealing the hollowness of a materialistic, consumer-driven definition of success. Postcolonial critics often emphasize that the pursuit of material success, as defined by Western capitalism comes at the cost of human and cultural values.

Nabeel's tragic end—his disappearance into the anonymity of history—serves as a commentary on how such "progress" may lead to personal and cultural loss rather than the fulfillment of a more holistic vision of human well-being. The movement of people in search of work underscores the

International Journal Of English and Studies(IJOES)
_____

persistence of global capitalist systems, which continue to exploit labor from the Global South. This can be linked to Immanuel Wallerstein's world-systems theory, which suggests that postcolonial countries are still economically dependent on the West, which continues to shape their political and economic realities. Another key point worth mentioning is Amitav Ghosh's own positioning within In An Antique Land, which serves as the ultimate challenge to the East-West binary. Ghosh, an Indian historian and writer trained in Western academic traditions, occupies a liminal space between the "East" and the "West." Being of Indian heritage himself, Amitav Ghosh travels to Egypt to conduct fieldwork for his doctoral research, which he is pursuing at Oxford University.

Colonial anthropology has historically perpetuated the East-West binary by positioning the anthropologist as a Western outsider who studies the "exotic other." Edward Said, in his seminal work Orientalism, critiqued this framework, arguing that it reduced Eastern cultures to static, inferior entities while privileging the West as a site of knowledge production and modernity. Ghosh himself comes from India, a nation that was colonized by the British, and his research takes him to Egypt, another country with a history of colonial domination. This Positioning is crucial, as Ghosh's work reflects the complexities of postcolonial identity—he is both an academic shaped by Western scholarly traditions and an individual from a formerly colonized nation. In this sense, Ghosh's engagement with Egypt, a former British colony, is not merely that of a researcher but of someone who understands the enduring impacts of Colonialism from both sides of the binary. This adds another layer of critique to his work, as he challenges colonial discourses while also questioning the role of the "outsider" researcher who enters postcolonial spaces. Unlike colonial anthropologists, Ghosh does not merely observe the villagers as detached "subjects." Instead, he forms personal relationships with individuals like Nabeel and Yasir, presenting them as complex, dynamic figures rather tan static representatives of "Eastern otherness." This approach aligns with postcolonial theorists who emphasized the need to "speak with" rather than "speak for" subaltern voices. By centering the lived experiences of the villagers, Ghosh disrupts the hierarchical framework of colonial anthropology. Moreover, Ghosh's narrative further complicates the East-West binary through the dynamics between him and the Egyptian villagers. The conversation between the narrator and the villagers not only highlights cultural misunderstandings but also illustrates a key theme in In An Antique Land: the reversal of roles between researcher and subject.

Rather than simply being the one who investigates, Ghosh, as the narrator, becomes the object of investigation. This inversion of roles challenges the traditional dynamic of ethnographic inquiry, where the researcher is typically the authority and the subject is the Passive object of study. In Ghosh's case, the villagers scrutinize him, question his intentions, and even express their skepticism about his presence in their community. This shift in power dynamics places Ghosh in the position of the "Other" as he becomes the subject of Anthropological inquiry in the eyes of the villagers. Thus, this cross-cultural encounter reflects a reversal of colonial and ethnographic hierarchies, positioning Ghosh as one being "anthropologized" by those who are traditionally viewed as the "subjects" of study.

In doing so, Ghosh not only subverts the East-West binary but also critiques the very act of studying cultures from an external, often colonial, standpoint. The concept of the "Third Space," as articulated by postcolonial theorists like Homi K. Bhabha, plays a crucial role in understanding the

International Journal Of English and Studies(IJOES)

_____

fluidity of identity in In An Antique Land. The "Third Space" refers to a cultural, social, or intellectual space where hybrid identities emerge, transcending rigid boundaries and offering opportunities for negotiation, transformation, and redefinition. Ghosh, as an individual straddling multiple worlds—Indian by heritage, trained in Western academia, and immersed in Egyptian fieldwork—embodies this "Third Space." His identity is not fixed or essentialized within the rigid categories of East or West. Instead, it is constantly evolving, fluid, and shaped by his interactions with different cultures, languages, and historical narratives. This fluidity of identity challenges binary thinking and highlights the complexity of postcolonial experiences. Ghosh's narrative is a prime example of how identities in a postcolonial world are not static but are in constant flux, formed through cross-cultural encounters. His engagement with the Egyptian villagers, for instance, forces him to navigate multiple roles—both as a researcher and as a participant in a local community. He is not simply an outsider from the West or the East; rather, he occupies a liminal space that defies such neat categorization.

The fluidity of identity is also evident in how Ghosh negotiates the cultural differences between himself and the villagers. While he may initially come across as the outsider with his academic background and modern sensibilities, he gradually becomes enmeshed in the local rhythms and everyday life of the village. Through his experiences, Ghosh demonstrates how identity is not something that can be defined once and for all but is constantly reshaped through interactions and experiences within the "Third Space." This dynamic exchange allows Ghosh to critique both the colonial legacy of anthropology and the limitations of rigid East-West dichotomies, instead advocating for a more complex, interconnected understanding of identity and culture. In this "Third Space," Ghosh's identity is not a fixed label but an evolving construct, shaped by both the East and West, by academic and lived experience, and by his position as both researcher and participant.

To summarise, Amitav Ghosh's In An Antique Land does much more than tell a captivating tale of history and anthropology; it shakes up the tired and oversimplified idea of an East-West divide. By blending personal narrative with ethnographic research, Ghosh forces us to Reconsider the boundaries that have long separated cultures, identities, and histories. His position as an Indian scholar trained in Western academia, yet conducting research in Egypt—another former colony—puts him in a unique space that allows him to question the very structures that have historically divided the "East" from the "West." First, Ghosh shows us that the pre-colonial world was not some isolated East, sitting quietly in the shadows while the West did all the "important stuff." He reveals a dynamic, interconnected world in which cultures were engaged in fluid exchanges long before colonialism imposed its artificial boundaries. Through the lens of the ancient Jewish and Islamic trade networks, Ghosh highlights the interwoven nature of East and West, disrupting the static portrayal of the East as an isolated, monolithic entity. Fast forward to modern Egypt, and Ghosh gives us a backstage pass to the complicated aftermath of colonialism. His portrayal of the modern Egyptian village, with its mix of tradition and modernity, demonstrates how cultures evolve and negotiate their place in a world shaped by colonial legacies.

And his own role, as an Indian scholar navigating Western academic waters while living in Egypt, isn't just interesting—it's the perfect metaphor for what happens when identity refuses to play by simple rules. Think about how the media portrays the "West" as a beacon of modernity and progress,

while the "East" is often stuck in the past, either mystifying or tragically misunderstood. Ghosh's book reminds us that cultures do not operate on a one-way street—if you are going to call one place modern and the other traditional, you better be ready to explain how one's "modernity" was built off the other's colonial past. In An Antique Land is not just an academic critique; it is a call to pay attention to how the world we live in today is shaped by centuries of exchanges, both big and small.

References:

Ghosh, Amitav. In An Antique Land: History in the Guise of a Traveler's Tale.Vintage, 2011.

Said, Edward W. Orientalism. Penguin Books India, 1995.

Silverman, Max. Frantz Fanon's "Black Skin, White Masks." Manchester UP, 2005.

Thapa, Neelam. "In An Antique Land: Locating the Dislocated." International Journal for Research in Applied Science and Engineering Technology, vol. 11, no. 11, Nov. 2023, pp. 2637–40. https://doi.org/10.22214/ijraset.2023.57185.